




MINUTES

CERTIFICATION OF CONFIRMATION OF TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE MINUTES

4 June 2015

I, Mr Simon Stewert-Dawkins hereby certify that the minutes from the Technical Advisory Committee Meeting held on 4 June 2015 pages 1 to 10 were confirmed at a Committee meeting held on 6 August 2015.



Signature

Mr Simon Stewert-Dawkins
Person presiding at Meeting

TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE

MINUTES

4 June 2015

(REF: D2015/07006)

A meeting of the Technical Advisory Committee was held at the EMRC Administration Office, 1st Floor, 226 Great Eastern Highway, BELMONT WA 6104 on **Thursday, 4 June 2015**. The meeting commenced at **4:00pm**.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1	DECLARATION OF OPENING AND ANNOUNCEMENT OF VISITORS	1
2	ATTENDANCE, APOLOGIES AND LEAVE OF ABSENCE (PREVIOUSLY APPROVED)	1
3	DISCLOSURE OF INTERESTS	1
4	ANNOUNCEMENTS BY THE CHAIRMAN OR PRESIDING MEMBER WITHOUT DISCUSSION	1
5	PETITIONS, DEPUTATIONS AND PRESENTATIONS	1
6	CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETINGS	2
	6.1 <i>MINUTES OF THE TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING HELD ON 7 MAY 2015 (Ref: D2015/06720)</i>	2
7	QUESTIONS BY MEMBERS OF WHICH DUE NOTICE HAS BEEN GIVEN	2
8	QUESTIONS BY MEMBERS WITHOUT NOTICE	2
9	ANNOUNCEMENT OF CONFIDENTIAL MATTERS FOR WHICH MEETINGS MAY BE CLOSED TO THE PUBLIC	2
10	BUSINESS NOT DEALT WITH FROM A PREVIOUS MEETING	2
11	REPORTS OF EMPLOYEES	3
	11.1 <i>TENDER 2014-008 LEACHATE TREATMENT SYSTEM (REF: D2015/07009)</i>	3
	11.2 <i>PURCHASE OF A 25-30 TONNE TRACK LOADER (Ref: D2015/07012)</i>	7
	11.3 <i>ITEMS CONTAINED IN THE INFORMATION BULLETIN (Ref: D2015/07018)</i>	10
12	REPORTS OF DELEGATES	10
13	NEW BUSINESS OF AN URGENT NATURE APPROVED BY THE CHAIRMAN OR PRESIDING MEMBER OR BY DECISION OF MEETING	10
14	CONFIDENTIAL MATTERS FOR WHICH THE MEETING MAY BE CLOSED TO THE PUBLIC	10
15	FUTURE MEETINGS OF THE TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE	10
16	DECLARATION OF CLOSURE OF MEETING	10



1 DECLARATION OF OPENING AND ANNOUNCEMENT OF VISITORS

The Chairman opened the meeting at 4:00pm.

2 ATTENDANCE, APOLOGIES AND LEAVE OF ABSENCE (PREVIOUSLY APPROVED)

Committee Members

Mr Simon Stewert-Dawkins (Chairman)	Director Operational Services	Town of Bassendean
Mr Dennis Blair	Director Infrastructure Services	Shire of Kalamunda
Mr Shane Purdy (<i>from 4:06pm</i>)	Director Infrastructure Services	Shire of Mundaring
Mr Jim Coten	Executive Manager Operations	City of Swan
Mr Peter Schneider	Chief Executive Officer	EMRC

Apologies

Mr Doug Pearson (Deputy Chairman)	Director Technical Services	City of Bayswater
Mr Ric Lutey	Director Technical Services	City of Belmont

EMRC Officers

Mr Stephen Fitzpatrick	Director Waste Services
Mr Hua Jer Liew	Director Corporate Services
Mr Gilbert Arlandoo	Manager Engineering & Waste Services
Mr Kevin Porter	Manager Compliance and Administration
Miss Giulia Bono	Administration Officer (Minutes)

Observer(s)

Mr Binh Luong	Coordinator Waste & Environmental Management	City of Bayswater
---------------	--	-------------------

3 DISCLOSURE OF INTERESTS

Nil

4 ANNOUNCEMENTS BY THE CHAIRMAN OR PRESIDING MEMBER WITHOUT DISCUSSION

Nil

5 PETITIONS, DEPUTATIONS AND PRESENTATIONS

Nil



6 CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETINGS

6.1 MINUTES OF THE TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING HELD ON 7 MAY 2015

That the Minutes of the Technical Advisory Committee meeting held on 7 May 2015, which have been distributed, be confirmed.

TAC RESOLUTION(S)

MOVED MR COTEN

SECONDED MR STEWERT-DAWKINS

THAT THE MINUTES OF THE TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING HELD ON 7 MAY 2015 WHICH HAVE BEEN DISTRIBUTED, BE CONFIRMED.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

7 QUESTIONS BY MEMBERS OF WHICH DUE NOTICE HAS BEEN GIVEN

Nil

8 QUESTIONS BY MEMBERS WITHOUT NOTICE

Nil

9 ANNOUNCEMENT OF CONFIDENTIAL MATTERS FOR WHICH THE MEETING MAY BE CLOSED TO THE PUBLIC

Nil

10 BUSINESS NOT DEALT WITH FROM A PREVIOUS MEETING

Nil



11 REPORTS OF OFFICERS

11.1 TENDER 2014-008 LEACHATE TREATMENT SYSTEM

REFERENCE: D2015/07009

PURPOSE OF REPORT

The purpose of this report is to advise Council of the results of Tender 2014-008 for the Supply, Installation, Operation and Demobilisation of a Leachate Treatment System at the Red Hill Waste Management Facility.

KEY ISSUES AND RECOMMENDATION(S)

- A tender for the Supply, Installation, Operation and Demobilisation of a Leachate Treatment System at the Red Hill Waste Management Facility was advertised on 15 October 2014.
- Tenders closed on 5 November 2014 with seven (7) submissions being received.
- Due to the complexity of the analysis independent advice was sought to assist the Evaluation Panel.

Recommendation(s)

That Council rejects all tender submissions for Tender 2014-008 Leachate Treatment System.

SOURCE OF REPORT

Director Waste Services
Manager Engineering and Waste Services

BACKGROUND

The leachate ponds around the Red Hill Waste Management Facility rely on recirculation of leachate in landfill and evaporation to reduce the levels over summer, to allow for the winter leachate to be stored. An assisted evaporation system has recently been commissioned to increase the evaporation of leachate.

The tender comprises all engineering, supervision, labour, materials, plant and equipment, tools, consumables and all other items necessary for the design, supply of all materials, manufacture, construction, installation, testing, operation and demobilisation of a Leachate Treatment System (the System) to treat surplus stored leachate at Red Hill Waste Management Facility.

REPORT

Tender 2014-008 for the Supply, Installation, Operation and Demobilisation of a Leachate Treatment System was advertised on 15 October 2014. A non-mandatory tender briefing / site inspection was held on 21 October 2014 at the Red Hill Waste Management Facility and was attended by two of the responding tenderers, as well as other companies who did not submit tenders.



Item 11.1 continued

Tenders closed on 5 November 2014 and seven (7) submissions were received from:

- a) Aquasol Pty Ltd;
- b) MAK Water;
- c) Osmoflo;
- d) Sacyr Industrial;
- e) Enviropacific Services Pty Ltd;
- f) Odour Control Systems International (Australia); and
- g) Iconic Water Solutions Pty Ltd.

The tenders were assessed by an Evaluation Panel and peer reviewed by an external consultant.

Compliance criteria

Each submission was assessed on a Yes/No basis as to whether the criterion was satisfactorily met. An assessment of "No" against any criterion may have eliminated the submission from consideration.

Description of Compliance criteria	Yes/No
(a) Compliance with the Specification contained in the Request.	Yes/No
(b) Compliance with the Conditions of Tendering for this Request.	Yes/No
(c) The Quality Assurance requirement for this Request is ISO 14001. Your organisation complies with this requirement.	Yes/No
(d) Compliance with the EMRC Environmental Protection requirements contained in the Request	Yes/No
(e) Compliance with and completion of the Price Schedule.	Yes/No

Qualitative criteria

Each submission was scored against the qualitative criteria below.

Description of Qualitative criteria	Weighting
(a) Occupational Health & Safety – The tenderer is to provide a Safety Management Plan.	5%
(b) Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks.	10%
(c) Environmental Protection - The tenderer is to provide details as applicable on their capacity to manage their environmental performance.	10%
(d) Timeframe – The tenderer is to provide details on their proposed timeframe for mobilisation, operation and demobilisation of the treatment system.	15%
(e) Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects/supply similar goods.	20%



Item 11.1 continued

Price Consideration

The price consideration for this request is as follows:

Criteria	Weighting
Tendered price inclusive of all operating expenses.	40%

Based on the compliance and qualitative criteria check, only the submissions from Osmoflo and Aquasol Pty Ltd progressed through to the clarifications stage of assessment, the other submissions being rejected based on various non-compliance issues.

The Evaluation Panel determined that the submission from Aquasol was the only conforming submission received and rejected the Osmoflo tender based on non-conformance with the tender specification after clarifications were received from that company. However, the Evaluation Panel believes that the Aquasol Pty Ltd proposal has technical issues and doubts the ability of the tendered solution to meet the contract specifications. More importantly, the Aquasol proposal would commit the EMRC to an expenditure of \$2,228,000 (ex. GST), which is well in excess of the budget allowance of \$1,300,000. It is therefore recommended to reject the Aquasol Pty Ltd tender submission.

Based on the Evaluation Panel's assessment which included independent peer review input it is recommended that all tender submissions be rejected.

The EMRC will now review the leachate management process and recommend a way forward which may include the development of a detailed system design for a long term leachate treatment system for the whole site which will then be issued for tender.

STRATEGIC/POLICY IMPLICATIONS

Key Result Area 1 – Environmental Sustainability

- 1.2 To improve regional waste management
- 1.4 To investigate leading edge waste management practices

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

Budget provisions totalling \$1,300,000 were made in the 2014-2015 Annual Budget for the Leachate Treatment Project. The cost of this tender is in excess of the budgeted amount in the approved budget.

SUSTAINABILITY IMPLICATIONS

In order to provide sustainable leachate management.



Item 11.1 continued

MEMBER COUNCIL IMPLICATIONS

Member Council	Implication Details
Town of Bassendean	} Nil
City of Bayswater	
City of Belmont	
Shire of Kalamunda	
Shire of Mundaring	
City of Swan	

ATTACHMENT(S)

Nil

VOTING REQUIREMENT

Simple Majority.

Discussion ensued

The CEO confirmed that funds for a future Leachate Treatment System at the Red Hill Waste Management Facility are included in the 2015-2016 budget.

Mr Purdy entered the meeting at 4:06pm.

RECOMMENDATION(S)

That Council rejects all tender submissions for Tender 2014-008 Leachate Treatment System.

TAC RECOMMENDATION(S)

MOVED MR BLAIR

SECONDED MR COTEN

That Council rejects all tender submissions for Tender 2014-008 Leachate Treatment System.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY



11.2 PURCHASE OF A 25-30 TONNE TRACK LOADER

REFERENCE: D2015/07012

PURPOSE OF REPORT

The purpose of this report is to recommend acceptance of a quotation for the supply and delivery of a 25-30 tonne Track Loader.

KEY ISSUES AND RECOMMENDATION(S)

- The Cat 973C track loader used for spreading waste at the tip face at Red Hill Waste Management Facility has reached its scheduled replacement time based on accumulated machine hours.
- Quotations were sought for a replacement 25-30 tonne track loader including an extended warranty and a maintenance service agreement using the WALGA eQuote system.
- Only one quotation was received from WesTrac.

Recommendation(s)

That Council:

1. Accepts the quote for the supply and delivery to Red Hill Waste Management Facility of one Cat 973D Track Loader with a five (5) year/10,000 hour extended warranty submitted by WesTrac for the sum of \$760,400.00 (ex. GST).
2. Accepts the offer to undertake the repair and maintenance agreement for the Cat 973D Track Loader to be located at Red Hill Waste Management Facility for a five (5) year/10,000 hour period submitted by WesTrac at a cost of \$24.64/hr (ex. GST).

SOURCE OF REPORT

Director Waste Services
Administration Manager Red Hill Waste Management Facility

BACKGROUND

Under the EMRC's plant replacement programme, the Cat 973C track loader, one of the two track loaders used at Red Hill Waste Management Facility is due for replacement having reached 10,000 hours of service.

REPORT

Quotations for the replacement of a 25-30 tonne Track Loader were sought using the WALGA e-quote system in February 2015. Only one quotation was received from WesTrac for a Cat 973D Track Loader, which has been evaluated by the Waste Services evaluation panel staff against the selection criteria detailed in the quotation specification.

Selection Criteria and Rating Scale

The submission was evaluated based on the criteria requested via the WALGA e-quote.



Item 11.2 continued

Compliance criteria

Each submission was assessed on a Yes/No basis as to whether the criterion was satisfactorily met. An assessment of “No” against any criterion may eliminate the submission from consideration.

Description of Compliance criteria	Yes/No
Complied with Specification contained in this e-Quote request	Yes/No

Qualitative criteria

The submission was scored against the qualitative criteria below.

Description of Qualitative criteria	Weighting
a) Tendered price including consideration of: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quoted price • Standard Warranty • Extended Warranty 5 year / 10,000 hours • Full Service and Repair agreement 5 year / 10,000 hours 	75%
b) Operator Assessment	25%

The operator assessment could not be undertaken because WesTrac do not have a machine of the specification requested available in Australia at present.

The evaluation process determined the submission from WesTrac for the Cat 973D Track Loader included all the items in the specification, including an extended warranty for 5 years/10,000 hours, full service/repair and maintenance quote.

The quotation submitted by WesTrac for a Cat 973D Track Loader is the only fully conforming submission received and is therefore the recommended supplier.

STRATEGIC/POLICY IMPLICATIONS

Key Result Area 1 – Environmental Sustainability

- 1.1 To provide sustainable waste disposal operations

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

A budget provision of \$780,000 was made in the 2014-2015 budget for the replacement of the Cat 973C Track Loader (PP1696).

SUSTAINABILITY IMPLICATIONS

The purchase of the new track loader will improve the economic sustainability of waste disposal operations.



Item 11.2 continued

MEMBER COUNCIL IMPLICATIONS

Member Council	Implication Details
Town of Bassendean	} Nil
City of Bayswater	
City of Belmont	
Shire of Kalamunda	
Shire of Mundaring	
City of Swan	

ATTACHMENT(S)

Nil

VOTING REQUIREMENT

Simple Majority

RECOMMENDATION(S)

That Council:

1. Accepts the quote for the supply and delivery to Red Hill Waste Management Facility of one Cat 973D Track Loader with a five (5) year/10,000 hour extended warranty submitted by WesTrac for the sum of \$760,400.00 (ex. GST).
2. Accepts the offer to undertake the repair and maintenance agreement for the Cat 973D Track Loader to be located at Red Hill Waste Management Facility for a five (5) year/10,000 hour period submitted by WesTrac at a cost of \$24.64/hr (ex. GST).

TAC RECOMMENDATION(S)

MOVED MR PURDY

SECONDED MR COTEN

That Council:

1. Accepts the quote for the supply and delivery to Red Hill Waste Management Facility of one Cat 973D Track Loader with a five (5) year/10,000 hour extended warranty submitted by WesTrac for the sum of \$760,400.00 (ex. GST).
2. Accepts the offer to undertake the repair and maintenance agreement for the Cat 973D Track Loader to be located at Red Hill Waste Management Facility for a five (5) year/10,000 hour period submitted by WesTrac at a cost of \$24.64/hr (ex. GST).

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

